

# **THESIS EXAMINER'S REPORT FORMS**



THESIS EXAMINER'S REPORT

Version française : *Rapport d'évaluation pour  
une thèse*

NAME OF STUDENT	STUDENT NUMBER	DOCTORAL THESIS <input type="checkbox"/>	MASTER'S THESIS <input type="checkbox"/>
DEGREE		ACADEMIC UNIT	
TITLE OF THESIS			
NAME OF THESIS SUPERVISOR		NAME OF THESIS CO-SUPERVISOR	
NAME OF EXAMINER		DEADLINE FOR SUBMISSION OF REPORT	

INSTRUCTIONS FOR EXAMINERS

**PART A: EVALUATION** / Tick off the choice that best describes your evaluation of the thesis.  
**PART B: COMMENTS** / Provide your comments for each of the topics listed.  
**PART C: RECOMMENDATION FOR A PRIZE** / Indicate your decision and complete the attached form if recommending thesis for a prize.  
**PART D: SIGNATURE** / Sign and date the form.  
**PART E: DOCUMENTS** / Return necessary documents.

PART A: EVALUATION

CRITERIA

**DOCTORAL THESIS:** THE THESIS must constitute a significant contribution to knowledge, embody the results of original investigation and analysis by the student and be of such quality as to merit publication.

**MASTER'S THESIS:** THE THESIS should demonstrate that the candidate is able to work in a scholarly manner and is acquainted with the principal works published on the subject of the thesis. Insofar as it is possible, the thesis should be an original contribution.

VERDICT

1	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p><b>The thesis <u>is accepted</u> for the defence.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The thesis meets the evaluation criteria listed above.</li> <li>Required changes are limited to correcting occasional grammatical or spelling errors, formatting problems or to minor redundancies or omissions (e.g., transitional paragraphs, notes).</li> </ul>
2	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p><b>The thesis <u>is accepted</u> for the defence but must be revised <u>AFTER DEFENCE</u>.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The quality of the presentation is acceptable, and the necessary revisions will not have an impact on the defence.</li> <li>During the defence, the jury will determine which revisions are necessary and who will be responsible for ensuring they have been completed and for approving the thesis.</li> </ul>
3	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p><b>The thesis <u>cannot be accepted</u> for the defence and must undergo extensive revision <u>BEFORE DEFENCE</u> to ensure it meets the above criteria.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There are problems with the interpretation of results or the theoretical or methodological approach, but the thesis may meet the criteria if substantial changes are made.</li> <li>The presentation of the thesis is not acceptable (numerous grammatical or spelling errors, evidence of carelessness, etc.).</li> </ul> <p>In this case, the thesis is returned to the candidate to complete the required revisions, corrections and changes. The candidate must submit a revised version of the thesis to the examiners. The examiners must judge the changes satisfactory before the thesis can proceed to the defence stage.</p>
4	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p><b>The thesis <u>fails to meet the standards required</u> for the degree.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The work was not done in accordance with established methodology employed by the discipline.</li> <li>The thesis does not exhibit the candidate's capacity to meet the scholarly standards required.</li> <li>Even with extensive revision, the thesis would not meet the standards required for the degree.</li> </ul> <p>In this case, the candidate may be asked to withdraw from the program.</p>

**NOTE:** Your feedback will have an impact on how the candidate prepares for the defence, the dean's decision if the jury is divided and the awarding of prizes. Please be sure to complete Section B regardless of your verdict.

## PART B: COMMENTS

Please provide your comments on each of the topics below in a separate document. If the thesis is accepted for the defence (see verdicts # 1 and # 2, above), your comments will be sent to the candidate and the thesis supervisor without reference to your identity. If major revisions are required before the defence (see verdict # 3, above), a signed copy of your comments will be provided to the student, the supervisor, as well as to all members of the jury and the chair of the academic unit.

- UNDERSTANDING OF THE SUBJECT MATTER
- CONTRIBUTION OF THE THESIS TO ADVANCING KNOWLEDGE
- RESEARCH METHODOLOGY
- ANALYSIS OF RESULTS AND VALUE OF CONCLUSIONS
- ORGANIZATION, WRITING STYLE AND PRESENTATION OF MATERIAL
- REVISIONS CONSIDERED NECESSARY IN ORDER FOR THESIS TO BE ACCEPTED
- GENERAL COMMENTS

Your comments and explanations are extremely important and will:

- help the student prepare for the defence or make necessary revisions to the thesis (if revisions are required before the defence, a signed copy of your comments is provided to the candidate, the thesis supervisor, as well as to all members of the jury and the chair of the academic unit);
- allow the dean of FGPS to make an informed decision if the jury is divided; and
- allow the FGPS selection committee to choose recipients of prizes and medals.

## PART C: RECOMMENDATION FOR A PRIZE

DO YOU RECOMMEND THIS THESIS FOR A PRIZE?

- (     ) YES – Please complete the attached NOMINATION FOR THESIS PRIZE form.  
(     ) NO

The absence of a reply will be considered a NO.

## PART D: SIGNATURE

DATE \_\_\_\_\_ SIGNATURE \_\_\_\_\_

## PART E: DOCUMENTS

### DOCTORAL THESIS

Please return all documents by email to [thesis@uOttawa.ca](mailto:thesis@uOttawa.ca) or by fax to 613-562-5992 and send the originals in the enclosed self-addressed envelope to:

Thesis Sector  
FGPS  
Hagen Hall  
115 Séraphin-Marion, Room 107  
Ottawa ON K1N 6N5

### MASTER'S THESIS

Please return all documents by email to [thesis@uOttawa.ca](mailto:thesis@uOttawa.ca) or by fax to 613-562-5992 and send the originals in the enclosed envelope to your academic unit.



THESIS EXAMINER'S REPORT FOR A  
**REVISED THESIS**

Version française : *Rapport d'évaluation pour  
une thèse remaniée*

NAME OF STUDENT		STUDENT NUMBER	DOCTORAL THESIS <input type="checkbox"/>	MASTER'S THESIS <input type="checkbox"/>
DEGREE		ACADEMIC UNIT		
TITLE OF THESIS				
NAME OF THESIS SUPERVISOR			NAME OF THESIS CO-SUPERVISOR	
NAME OF EXAMINER			DEADLINE FOR SUBMISSION OF REPORT	
<b>INSTRUCTIONS FOR EXAMINERS</b>				
<p><b>PART A: EVALUATION</b> / Tick off the choice that best describes your evaluation of the revised thesis.</p> <p><b>PART B: COMMENTS</b> / Provide your comments for each of the topics listed.</p> <p><b>PART C: RECOMMENDATION FOR A PRIZE</b> / Indicate your decision and complete the attached form if recommending thesis for a prize.</p> <p><b>PART D: SIGNATURE</b> / Sign and date the form</p> <p><b>PART E: DOCUMENTS</b> / Return necessary documents.</p>				
<b>PART A: EVALUATION</b>				
<b>CRITERIA</b>				
<p><b>DOCTORAL THESIS:</b> THE THESIS must constitute a significant contribution to knowledge, embody the results of original investigation and analysis by the student and be of such quality as to merit publication.</p> <p><b>MASTER'S THESIS:</b> THE THESIS should demonstrate that the candidate is able to work in a scholarly manner and is acquainted with the principal works published on the subject of the thesis. Insofar as it is possible, the thesis should be an original contribution.</p>				
<b>VERDICT</b>				
1	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p>The revised thesis is <b>accepted</b> for the defence.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The revised thesis meets the evaluation criteria listed above.</li> <li>Required changes are limited to correcting occasional grammatical or spelling errors, formatting problems or to minor redundancies or omissions (e.g., transitional paragraphs, notes).</li> </ul>		
2	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p>The revised thesis is <b>accepted</b> for the defence but <b>additional changes are required AFTER DEFENCE</b>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The quality of the presentation is acceptable and the necessary changes will not have an impact on the defence.</li> <li>During the defence, the jury will determine which additional changes are necessary and who will be responsible for ensuring they have been completed and for approving the thesis.</li> </ul>		
3	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p>The revised thesis <b>still cannot be accepted for the defence</b> and must undergo additional extensive revision <b>BEFORE DEFENCE</b> to ensure it meets the above criteria.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There are still problems with the interpretation of results or the theoretical or methodological approach, but the thesis may meet the criteria if substantial changes are made.</li> <li>The presentation of the revised thesis is still not acceptable (numerous grammatical or spelling errors, evidence of carelessness, etc.).</li> </ul> <p>In this case, the revised thesis is returned to the candidate to complete additional revisions, corrections and changes. The candidate must submit a new revised version of the thesis to the examiners. The examiners must judge the changes satisfactory before the thesis can proceed to the defence stage.</p> <p><b>If more than one examiner chooses this verdict for the revised thesis, the student must withdraw from the program.</b></p>		
4	<input type="checkbox"/>	<p>The revised thesis <b>still fails to meet the standards required</b> for the degree.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The work was not done in accordance with established methodology employed in the discipline.</li> <li>The thesis still does not exhibit the candidate's capacity to meet the scholarly standards required.</li> <li>Even with additional extensive revision, the thesis would not meet the standards required for the degree.</li> </ul> <p><b>By choosing this verdict, the examiner recommends the student withdraw from the program. If more than one examiner chooses this verdict for the revised thesis, the student must withdraw from the program.</b></p>		
<p><b>NOTE:</b> Your feedback will have an impact on how the candidate prepares for the defence, the dean's decision if the jury is divided and the awarding of prizes. Please be sure to complete Section B regardless of your verdict.</p>				

## PART B: COMMENTS

Please provide your comments on each of the topics below in a separate document. If the thesis is accepted for the defence (see verdicts # 1 and # 2, above), your comments will be sent to the candidate and the thesis supervisor without reference to your identity. If major revisions are required before the defence (see verdict # 3, above), a signed copy of your comments will be provided to the student, the supervisor, as well as to all members of the jury and the chair of the academic unit.

- UNDERSTANDING OF THE SUBJECT MATTER
- CONTRIBUTION OF THE THESIS TO ADVANCING KNOWLEDGE
- RESEARCH METHODOLOGY
- ANALYSIS OF RESULTS AND VALUE OF CONCLUSIONS
- ORGANIZATION, WRITING STYLE AND PRESENTATION OF MATERIAL
- REVISIONS CONSIDERED NECESSARY IN ORDER FOR THESIS TO BE ACCEPTED
- GENERAL COMMENTS

Your comments and explanations are extremely important and will:

- help the student prepare for the defence or make necessary revisions to the thesis (if revisions are required before the defence, a **signed copy** of your comments is provided to the candidate, the thesis supervisor, as well as to all members of the jury and the chair of the academic unit);
- allow the dean of FGPS to make an informed decision if the jury is divided; and
- allow the FGPS selection committee to choose recipients of prizes and medals.

## PART C: RECOMMENDATION FOR A PRIZE

DO YOU RECOMMEND THIS THESIS FOR A PRIZE?

- (     ) YES – Please complete the attached NOMINATION FOR THESIS PRIZE form.  
(     ) NO

The absence of a reply will be considered a NO.

## PART D: SIGNATURE

DATE \_\_\_\_\_ SIGNATURE \_\_\_\_\_

## PART E: DOCUMENTS

### DOCTORAL THESIS

Please return all documents by email to [thesis@uOttawa.ca](mailto:thesis@uOttawa.ca) or by fax to 613-562-5992 and send the originals in the enclosed self-addressed envelope to:

Thesis Sector  
FGPS  
Hagen Hall  
115 Séraphin-Marion, Room 107  
Ottawa ON K1N 6N5

### MASTER'S THESIS

Please return all documents by email to [thesis@uOttawa.ca](mailto:thesis@uOttawa.ca) or by fax to 613-562-5992 and send the originals in the enclosed envelope to your academic unit.